The Problem with DoDAF Models

Michael J. Vinarcik, P.E., FESD, Chief Solutions Architect
Mark S. Gibson, SAIC Fellow
Bringing Rigor and Consistency to DoDAF Artifacts

Problem
• Programs receive DoDAF artifacts that often are not fully reviewed due to the effort involved
• Static artifacts may not facilitate agile development / set-based design
• Architecture gaps lead to downstream errors, rework, and cost/schedule overruns

Solution
• The NomoGraph process was developed (by Mark Gibson, former Engility) as an Excel-based method to assess DoDAF artifact quality
• The improved NomoGraph process uses MagicDraw, a system modeling tool, to:
  – Reduce the costs associated with analyzing DoDAF artifacts
  – Increase the number of analyses available
  – Allow for automated validation rules and error-checking
• Similar validation rules can be applied to any DoDAF/UAF products before submission to improve the quality of deliverables
The Problem
The amount of systems engineering required for a given project is fixed. You don’t get to choose how much systems engineering you do. You simply get to choose when you do it (up front, or during integration and testing), how much positive impact it has, and how much it costs.

— James Long, FINCOSE
System Complexity is Growing Exponentially

GROWTH OF SOFTWARE COMPLEXITY IN MILITARY AIRCRAFT
Thousands of Lines of Code (KSLOC) Used in Specific Aircraft Over Time

- F-106
- F-111
- FB-111
- F-15A
- F-16A
- F-16C
- F-16Es
- F-22
- F-16Es4E+
- F-16/50m2
- F-15CDs
- F-16Es0
- F-15CDs0
- F-15Es2
- F-15CDs2
- F-15Es4
- F-15CDs4
- F-15Es0T3
- JSF CTOL


KSLOC
0 1,000 2,000 3,000 4,000 5,000 6,000

The Department of Defense Recognizes Current Approaches Cannot Manage This Explosion in Complexity

“Our current defense acquisition system applies industrial age processes to solve information age problems.”

— LtGen Robert D. McMurray, AFLCMC/CC
The Solution: Rigor At the Speed of Relevance

**rigor** noun

The quality or state of being very exact, careful, or strict.

— Merriam-Webster, 2017
The Solution: Rigor At the Speed of Relevance

**rígør** noun

Scrupulous adherence to established standards for conduct of work

DoD Vision: Gain Rigor via Digital Engineering (DE) And Accelerate Technical Integration by Connecting Data
The Problem With DODAF Application

MODEL BASED ENGINEERING (MBE) ENVISIONED

Complete Model Builds Consistent Viewpoints

MODEL BASED ENGINEERING (MBE) PRACTICED

Contractors/PM’s only Build/Deliver Required Viewpoints on a Compliance Checklist

Limited Number of Viewpoints Cannot Build Complete Model

Courtesy Mark Gibson, SAIC Technical Fellow
The Problem with DoDAF

• Intended as an architectural framework

• Leads to siloed, disconnected views of system

• No guarantee of consistency between views

• Often delivered as PDFs, Excel, or other disjointed artifacts

• Recipients cannot or do not review thoroughly
The Problem with DoDAF

“Shelfware” reputation for DoDAF
Tolerance of non-rigor
Architecting defines what to design, while design defines what to build.

Expectations > Current Reality

Failure to assess architecture quality results in:

• Cybersecurity vulnerabilities
• Design errors
• Test failures
• Increased costs (especially integration)
• Negative schedule impact
A Customer Example:
Government Program (Head Start) Findings

45 DoD Information Support Plan (ISP) Assessed over 18 months

0% were fully correct
50% did not submit all the required views
100% had alignment/traceability/taxonomy issues

97% ALIGNMENT / TRACEABILITY / TAXONOMY issues between the DoDAF viewpoints

92% Unclear test measures
87% Problems defining missions and task

Courtesy Mark Gibson, SAIC Technical Fellow
The Approach
The NomoGraph Approach

How do you determine if an architecture package is complete, consistent, and traceable?
The NomoGraph Approach

What type of review is done for contractor deliverables before submission for review in IAMS?
The NomoGraph Approach

Is the Taxonomy consistent across viewpoints?
The NomoGraph Approach

Do the Viewpoints (Models) have all the required fields to ensure Viewpoint (Model) traceability?

Courtesy Mark Gibson, SAIC Technical Fellow
The NomoGraph Approach

Have you verified and validated your models before giving them to downstream users?

Courtesy Mark Gibson, SAIC Technical Fellow
The NomoGraph Approach

Do you contract for DoDAF Core Model Delivery or for DoDAF Viewpoints?

Courtesy Mark Gibson, SAIC Technical Fellow
The NomoGraph Approach

Are the DoDAF Models altered by hand ("Hand Jamming") after being generated by Modeling Software?

Courtesy Mark Gibson, SAIC Technical Fellow
What is an Architecture NomoGraph?

- Multi-dimensional Relational Analysis using a series of aligned tables that relate design parameters
- Graphically displays errors with relationships of model elements.
- Relates multiple operational and system parameters to check consistency

While it is effective, it is labor intensive.
Extreme Example of Errors Relating OV-3 and SV-6 DoDAF Viewpoints

RELATIONSHIPS

- 2,000 Correct
- 4,000 Wrong

TRACEABILITY

- 18% Correct
- 82% Wrong

Courtesy Mark Gibson, SAIC Technical Fellow
Improved NomoGraph

Initial NomoGraphs were executed in Microsoft Excel

Formulae may “fail silently”

Not all relevant questions may be answered
Improved NomoGraph

Cameo Enterprise Architecture (MagicDraw)

SysML

Structured Expressions
Improved NomoGraph

Guiding Principles

Fastest, least customized approach to import, connect, and analyze information

Do not create what can be unambiguously inferred
The Solution
Proof of Concept: Analysis Rules

- **SysML NomoGraph**
  - Imported into MagicDraw
    - OV-3, SV-2, SV-6...
  - 3 Customizations
    - Operational Exchange
    - Resource Exchange
    - Performer
  - Import
    - Exchanged Elements
    - Performers
  - Develop Custom Queries
    - Usage (defined but not used)
    - Unimplemented OEs
    - Interfaces
Matrices
Validation Suites
Conclusion
Rapid Analysis Is Possible

- DoDAF artifacts can be converted into SysML elements for analysis using structured queries and validation rules
- This allows key advantages of MBSE to be realized without the burden of recreating every DoDAF view and artifact
- Time to complete this analysis: <16 hours (some of that was invested in method development)
- Other projects can leverage the custom queries and modeling pattern to produce improved NomoGraphs
- Using MagicDraw allows additional queries to be created using the established relationships and elements

Value can be rapidly extracted even if descriptive system model is not available
Benefits

**Improved NomoGraph evaluation process can be applied to:**
- Internal DoDAF/UAF work
- Delivered CDRLs and artifacts

**The Outcome:**
- Improved:
  - Rigor
  - Speed of delivery
  - Support for agile / set-based design
  - Program outcomes
  - Error detection
  - Cybersecurity and integration
- Programs succeed at lower cost and with reduced schedule slippage