How Mature is Your Appraisal Team?

Dr. Rick Hefner, TRW

National Defense Industrial Association
2nd Annual CMMI Technology Conference and User Group

November 11-14, 2002
What are Mature Appraisal Practices?

• Formal appraisals (e.g., CBA IPI, SCAMPI) are expensive and time consuming
  – To reduce cost and increase efficiency, industry should identify appraisal best practices – but how?

• CMMI model describes a “capable process” as one that can satisfy its specified product quality, service quality, and process performance objectives

• If Appraisal was a CMMI process area, what would it look like? How would “appraisal capability” be measured?

• What are the implications:
  – Selecting an appraiser?
  – Running an in-house appraisal program?
Applying Maturity Concepts to Appraisals

Continuous representation

Method Description Document:

1.1 Analyze Requirements
1.2 Develop Appraisal Plan
1.3 Select and Prepare Team
1.4 Obtain and Analyze Initial Objective Evidence
1.5 Prepare for Collection of Objective Evidence
2.1 Examine Objective Evidence
2.2 Verify and Validate Objective Evidence
2.3 Document Objective Evidence
2.4 Generate Appraisal Results
3.1 Deliver Appraisal Results
3.2 Package and Archive Appraisal Assets

GG 1 Achieve Specific Goals
   GP 1.1 Perform Base Practices
GG 2 Institutionalize a Managed Process
   GP 2.1 Establish an Organizational Policy
   GP 2.2 Plan the Process
   GP 2.3 Provide Resources
   GP 2.4 Assign Responsibility
   GP 2.5 Train People
   GP 2.6 Manage Configurations
   GP 2.7 Identify and Involve Relevant Stakeholders
   GP 2.8 Monitor and Control the Process
   GP 2.9 Objectively Evaluate Adherence
   GP 2.10 Review Status with Higher Level Management
GG 3 Institutionalize a Defined Process
   GP 3.1 Establish a Defined Process
   GP 3.2 Collect Improvement Information
GG 4 Institutionalize a Quantitatively Managed Process
   GP 4.1 Establish Quantitative Objectives for the Process
   GP 4.2 Stabilize Subprocess Performance
GG 5 Institutionalize an Optimizing Process
   GP 5.1 Ensure Continuous Process Improvement
   GP 5.2 Correct Root Causes of Problems
Capability Level 0: Incomplete

- Either not performed or partially performed.
  - One or more of the specific goals of the process area are not satisfied.

- The SCAMPI Method Description Document is not followed – not all required activities are performed.
Capability Level 1: Performed

- Satisfies the specific goals of the process area. Supports and enables the work needed to produce identified outputs using identified inputs.
- GP 1.1 Perform Base Practices – *Perform all required activities in the Method Description Document*

1.1 Analyze Requirements
1.1.1 Determine Appraisal Objectives
1.1.2 Determine Appraisal Constraints
1.1.3 Determine Appraisal Scope
1.1.4 Determine Outputs
1.2 Develop Appraisal Plan
1.2.1 Tailor Method
1.2.2 Identify Needed Resources
1.2.3 Determine Cost and Schedule
1.2.4 Plan and Manage Logistics
1.2.5 Document and Manage Risks
1.2.6 Obtain Commitment to Appraisal Plan
1.3 Select and Prepare Team
1.3.1 Identify Team Leader
1.3.2 Select Team Members
1.3.3 Prepare Team
1.4 Obtain and Analyze Initial Objective Evidence
1.4.1 Prepare Participants
1.4.2 Administer Instruments
1.4.3 Obtain Initial Objective Evidence
1.4.4 Inventory Objective Evidence
1.5 Prepare for Collection of Objective Evidence
1.5.1 Perform Readiness Review
1.5.2 Prepare Data Collection Plan
1.5.3 Replan Data Collection

2.1 Examine Objective Evidence
2.1.1 Examine Objective Evidence from Instruments
2.1.2 Examine Objective Evidence from Presentations
2.1.3 Examine Objective Evidence from Documents
2.1.4 Examine Objective Evidence from Interviews
2.2 Verify and Validate Objective Evidence
2.2.1 Verify Objective Evidence
2.2.2 Characterize Implementation of Model Practices
2.2.3 Validate Practice Implementation Gaps
2.3 Document Objective Evidence
2.3.1 Take/Review/Tag Notes
2.3.2 Record Presence/Absence of Objective Evidence
2.3.3 Document Practice Implementation Gaps
2.3.4 Review and Update the Data Collection Plan

2.4 Generate Appraisal Results
2.4.1 Derive Findings and Rate Goals
2.4.2a Determine Process Area Capability Level
2.4.2b Determine Satisfaction of Process Areas
2.4.3a Determine Capability Profile
2.4.3b Determine Maturity Level
2.4.4 Document Appraisal Results

3.1 Deliver Appraisal Results
3.1.1 Present Final Findings
3.1.2 Conduct Executive Session(s)
3.1.3 Plan for Next Steps
3.2 Package and Archive Appraisal Assets
3.2.1 Collect Lessons Learned
3.2.2 Generate Appraisal Record
3.2.3 Provide Appraisal Feedback to CMMI Steward
3.2.4 Archive and/or Dispose of Key Artifacts
Capability Level 2: Managed

• Management of the process is concerned with the institutionalization of the process area and the achievement of other specific objectives established for the process, such as cost, schedule, and quality objectives.

• Making the analogy between engineering and appraisal:
  – Project: An individual appraisal
  – Organization: The group conducting appraisals (internal or vendor)

• GP 2.1 Establish an Organizational Policy – *rules for all appraisals*
  ✓ GP 2.2 Plan the Process – *Required by the MDD*
  ✓ GP 2.3 Provide Resources – *Implied by the MDD*
  ✓ GP 2.4 Assign Responsibility – *Required by the MDD, can expand on roles*
  ✓ GP 2.5 Train People – *Minimum required by the MDD, can expand*
  ✓ GP 2.6 Manage Configurations – *Minimum required by the MDD, can expand*
  ✓ GP 2.7 Identify and Involve Relevant Stakeholders – *Required by the MDD*
  ✓ GP 2.8 Monitor and Control the Process – *Implicit Lead Appraiser responsibility*
• GP 2.9 Objectively Evaluate Adherence – *Appraisals process and product audits*
• GP 2.10 Review Status with Higher Level Management – *Periodic reporting*
Capability Level 3: Defined

- Tailored from the organization's set of standard processes according to the organization's tailoring guidelines, and contributes work products, measures, and other process-improvement information to the organizational process assets.

- GP 3.1 Establish a Defined Process – *Organizationally defined process for conducting appraisals, tailored for each appraisal according to established guidelines*

- GP 3.2 Collect Improvement Information – *Collect work products and measures to continuously improve the appraisal process*
Capability Level 4: Quantitatively Managed

- **Controlled using statistical and other quantitative techniques.**
  - Quantitative objectives for quality and process performance are established and used as criteria in managing the process.
  - Quality and process performance are understood in statistical terms and are managed throughout the life of the process.

- **GP 4.1 Establish Quantitative Objectives for the Process** – *Established quality and process performance objectives for each appraisal*

- **GP 4.2 Stabilize Subprocess Performance** – *Stabilized subprocesses within the overall appraisal process (e.g., planning, consolidation)*
Capability Level 5: Optimizing

• Changed and adapted to meet relevant current and projected business objectives.
  – Focuses on continually improving the process performance through both incremental and innovative technological improvements.
  – Process improvements that would address root causes of process variation and measurably improve the organization’s processes are identified, evaluated, and deployed as appropriate.
  – Improvements are selected based on a quantitative understanding of their expected contribution to achieving the organization’s process-improvement objectives versus the cost and impact to the organization.
  – Performance of the organization’s processes is continually improved.

• GP 5.1 Ensure Continuous Process Improvement – Continuously improving appraisal process

• GP 5.2 Correct Root Causes of Problems – Identification and correction of root causes of appraisal defects (e.g., inaccurate results, late nights)
Rating TRW’s Appraisal Process - 1

GG 1 Achieve Specific Goals
✓ GP 1.1 Perform Base Practices – All TRW SCAMPI appraisals follow the MDD

GG 2 Institutionalize a Managed Process
✓ Organizational Policy – TRW Appraisal Description Document (ADD) created to guide all TRW appraisals
✓ GP 2.2 Plan the Process – Appraisal Plan
✓ GP 2.3 Provide Resources – In Appraisal Plan
✓ GP 2.4 Assign Responsibility – In Appraisal Plan, plus defined responsibilities in TRW ADD for site coordinator, etc.
✓ GP 2.5 Train People – MDD-required course, plus standard TRW on-site training
✓ GP 2.6 Manage Configurations – Described in TRW ADD
✓ GP 2.7 Identify and Involve Relevant Stakeholders – In Appraisal Plan
✓ GP 2.8 Monitor and Control the Process – Specific Lead Appraiser responsibilities described in TRW ADD
✓ GP 2.9 Objectively Evaluate Adherence – Process and product audits of appraisals conducted by independent QA
✓ GP 2.10 Review Status with Higher Level Management – Monthly reporting of appraisal conduct and results to Vice President
Rating TRW’s Appraisal Process - 1

GG 3 Institutionalize a Defined Process

✓ GP 3.1 Establish a Defined Process – TRW defined process (ADD) for conducting appraisals, tailored for each appraisal according to established guidelines
✓ GP 3.2 Collect Improvement Information – Collect work products and measures from each appraisal to continuously improve the appraisal process

Initiated a Six Sigma project to address the Level 4 and 5 practices

GG 4 Institutionalize a Quantitatively Managed Process

• GP 4.1 Establish Quantitative Objectives for the Process
• GP 4.2 Stabilize Subprocess Performance

GG 5 Institutionalize a Optimizing Process

• GP 5.1 Ensure Continuous Process Improvement
• GP 5.2 Correct Root Causes of Problems
Summary

- The CMMI continuous structure provides a useful way to assess the maturity of your appraisal process.

- Industry should continue to expand the discussion of what constitutes “mature” appraisal practices.